



## **MOTIVE PROJECT**

Project No. 609781-EPP-1-2019-IT-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP

**“MONITORING TRENDS IN VIETNAMESE GRADUATES’ EMPLOYMENT”**

### **MINUTES OF MEETING**

**PROJECT CONSORTIUM MEETING AND CAPACITY TRANSFER**

**“GRADUATES AND LABOUR MARKET”**

Bologna, 18-20 May 2022



From 18 to 20 of May 2022, in Bologna, AlmaLaurea Interuniversity Consortium, coordinator of the project **“MONitoring Trends in Vietnamese graduates’ Employment”** (Project No. 609781-EPP-1-2019-IT-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP) organized a project meeting with the topic Graduates and Labour market, with an emphasis on capacity building activities for beneficiaries as Vietnamese staff and Vietnamese partners (Universities, Ministry and Business representatives).

The meeting was organized in three days of activities: first day dedicated to capacity transfer of policies related to graduates employability and sustainability, second day dedicated to the topic graduates and labour market and capacity transfer from IT staff of Almalaurea to Vietnamese partners related to interlinking different platform and creation of the National Portal for Graduates Tracking, while the third one was dedicated to policies in graduates labour market with a particular attention dedicated to the graduates gender differences in labour market.

At meeting participated almost 50 delegates in presence, from: Ministry of Education and Training of Vietnam (MOET), Hanoi University (HANU); Posts and Telecommunications Institute of Technology (PTIT), National University of Art Educations (NUAE), Hanoi University of Home Affairs (HUHA), Vietnam University of Agriculture (VNUA), Thai Nguyen University (TNU), Halong University (HALOU); Hanoi Tourism College (HTC); Hanoi Association of Small and Medium Size Enterprises (HanoiSME).

From European side in presence participated the representative of FH Joanneum, University of Applied Science, Graz, Austria.

Remotely participated the partners from Academy of Journalism and Communication (AJC), University of Barcelona (UB, Spain), International Consultancy and Mobility Agency (INCOMA; Spain) and National Agency for Quality Assurance (ANECA, Spain).

During the second day the winner of the call for papers for students, Ms. Kim Ngan Nguen was connected on Zoom platform as well.

## **Welcome Address**

### **Dorel Manitiu, Project Coordinator AlmaLaurea**

The Project coordinator, welcomes all participants (in presence and on line) and underline few crucial points of the project, including the great opportunity given by the MOTIVE project to all participants not only for the value of the cooperation itself between Asia and Europe, but also for the enhancing of capacity building activities in Vietnam.



Nowadays, the platform developed under the previous project hosted by Hanoi University are present 21 universities! It is a huge result obtained mainly due to the efforts made by Hanoi University staff, especially Prof. Dang Thi Phuong Thao and Hoang Thu Thuy with the strong support of Hanoi University's Rector, professor Nguyen Van Trao, and the technical and scientific contribution of Mr. Nguyen Hoang Duong in his quality of Vice Director of HANU IT Center and Prof. Ngo Phuong Dung, as national research leader and their efforts are well represented in the results achieved.

The important number of universities taking part in the network is represented also by a high number of students registered on the platform, as well as companies who are posting their job offers.

Moreover, seeing the potential of the work done until now by Vietnamese partners is strongly recommended the universities that are registered on the HANU Platform to certify the registration data of their students! This is a crucial element that give an important added value of such tool, by making available to companies your students CV's certified by own University. This is the element that make the difference between the platform that you manage now and other placement platforms as, LinkedIn or other similar.

On the other hand, it was underlined as well the importance of Local dissemination events for our MOTIVE Project, organized at each University level: as already have been done in different Universities (Thay Bac, HUHA Branch, ), local dissemination events are crucial to inform the stakeholders and the students about MOTIVE project objectives and importance and all universities were invited to continue and organize such events at university level.

**Ministry of Education and Training of Vietnam:** The MOET representative underlines the critical importance of the universities enterprises cooperation in Vietnam and the huge need of human resources following the pandemic. The activities of MOET are introduced in particular those devoted to orientation and employability as the organization of job fairs, invitation of the alumni association for counselling and the hosting of internship in a real working environment. Standard scheme to promote entrepreneurship have been established by MOET in 2017 with the following scope: promote job counselling; assess the students possibility in the labour market and provide statistics; provide a tool kit to improve such goals. As for the latter point, MOTIVE project has facilitated universities to develop evaluation skills and technology also providing very effective workshops and capacity building activities.. MOET thanks AlmaLaurea for the excellent job performed and for the fruitful cooperation.

**AJC Rector- Professor So Pham (online):** The Rector introduces the university activities and underlines the training activities done within the organization to almost 8000 students. He stresses that assessing



students employability after graduation represents a central issue for AJC and the main reason for joining the MOTIVE project.

**HALONG University-Vice Rector:** MOTIVE represents a good chance for the students to improve their application and for the universities to assess job career. HALONG students are developing their start up which is very important in Vietnam. Give the opportunity to universities to tracking graduates so to give students new opportunities is one of the main reason for HALONG to joining MOTIVE.

**HANU-Rector:** Despite two years of pandemic the MOTIVE project achieved the planned objectives. The Rector stresses that HANU is proud to host the project platform as an important tool for the governance of the HE system in Vietnam and for the educational system at large.

**TNU:** The representative briefly underlines that the TNU university has carried out numerous activities at university level to improve the quality of the educational supply. In such way MOTIVE project is an important tool for graduate tracking in Vietnam and the preliminary results of the survey are very positive.

**VNUA:** The university is very interested in MOTIVE for connecting business to universities; the students are very excited to take active part to the project so to improve also the connection with stakeholders in the labour market.

**HUHA Vice Rector:** HUHA has full commitment to reach project goals; as such the university follows the principle of MOTIVE that provides a systemic approach for survey making. The National Center to be build up within the project is of a significant importance to enhance the dialogue among stakeholders. The MOTIVE project will held HUHA to work better in the future.

**HTC:** At HTC about 6000 students are trained and job issue for the students is the goal that the universities should address. We hope that MOTIVE will help to solve such issue and in particular that the project will help to improve the curricula standards in Vietnam according to the international ones.

**NUAE Rector:** The Rector stresses how the NUAE already joined VOYAGE project and in the project framework performed many activities to help the graduates find a job. MOTIVE initiative is very important for the workshops and capacity building provided.

**PTIT representative:** MOTIVE gives the Vietnamese universities the opportunity to improve employment opportunities by bridging university and enterprises in the country. The possibility to create CV and fill out surveys by the students, provided by the project, is very needed in the country.

**HANOI SMEs:** The association of enterprises is very glad to have joined the project form the very beginning (Voyage project). 30000 companies are based in Hanoi, most small and medium enterprises. MOTIVE is a valuable initiative as provided the students to be better equipped when they enter the labour market.



**FH-Joanneum:** The university is very happy to be in MOTIVE consortium and very curious to see the expected results.

**INCOMA:** INCOMA introduces the organization activities and welcome the participant.

**University of Barcelona:** introduces the presentation to be made in afternoon capacity building session related to Catalan system for graduates tracking and welcome the participants.

**ANECA:** ANECA introduces the organization activities and welcome the participant.

## SUSTAINABILITY

As part of this session, the Steering Committee was involved in the following steps of the meeting.

AlmaLaurea delivers a presentation related to the future sustainability of the MOTIVE project. Sustainability structure (as by project proposal) including the milestone, tasks and outputs are presented as well as the sustainability configuration of the AlmaLaurea consortium. The presentation is an introduction to the sustainability discussion among the members of the consortium and is based on the following issues:

-**Center Mission:** survey release, promotion of research activities, networking

-**Center configuration:** the Center is structured in a centralized way (only one node) to host data of the MOTIVE universities and allow a shared management of the system. The Center will use the students database (VOYAGE platform) as main repository of students' data for graduates tracking release

-**Management:** decisional unit, staff, organigram

-**Center Teams' main units and functions:** Consortium Coordinator, IT team, Research Unit, communication team, Quality Assurance unit, Stakeholders unit

-**How to join:** Conditions and steps for joining the Center will be discussed during SC.

Also the Center structure definition and sustainability agreement as by project proposal-2018 is introduced:

-**Center configuration:** HANU host the University Database and is a candidate to host the Center Portal in joint management with AJC university

-**Management:** Universities joining the Center are committed to use their inner human resources, equipment provided by the project and the needed facilities for allowing the Center to work beyond project life



**-Dissemination:** Consortium member, together with Ho Chi Minh Open University, as associated partner, and eventually new entrants, will contribute to disseminate project objectives and expected results in the Vietnam, notably for the enlargement of the National Center for graduates tracking

Than the **discussion points** to be agreed on so to reach the Sustainability Agreement detailing the Sustainability plan are introduced:

***Center staff appointment and functions***

**-Decisional unit** (some/all members of MOTIVE steering committee? other ideas?)

**-IT team:** System (Voyage database) and Center platform management (at the moment HANU, AJC plus IT staff from each university for the update of the courses/faculties/departments list to HANU)

**-Scientific Committee** (critical issues for survey release and studies)

**and/or Research Team:** graduates tracking surveys and other studies

**-How to make and deliver the survey to the Center?** (i.e. each university makes its survey and the Center research team summarize the results at national level or on a rotating basis)

**-Working Paper publication** (who manage the dissemination of the initiative, the revision and publication? Should be the Scientific Committee)

**-Stakeholder network promotion and update** (all universities will send updates twice a year) through local dissemination events, annual meetings, on spot visits to new universities etc.

**-Financing the Center beyond project life:** Universities contributions (staff in kind); public funds? Others?

**The discussion is open:**

**VNUA** stresses that three main issues have to be taken into account when talking about future sustainability:

-quality of the data

-security of data

-commitment of the universities to update the platform data

As for the future of the Center, it could be created as an NGO form or as an official unit of the MOET

**HANU** Rector stresses that HANU will be ready and happy to host the Center but that at the same time the support of all the universities in terms of staff (in particular IT staff) is needed given to the huge amount of graduates data to manage within the platform.

**HANOI SMEs** agrees that HANU host the Center Platform in the future.



MOET suggest that the Rector of HANU can be appointed as Director of the Center, as an important unit for consultation for the Ministry.

Next steps: AlmaLaurea, having collected all the feedback from the consortium, will draft a questionnaire pointing out all the sustainability points to be agreed and will deliver it to MOTIVE consortium members as a guideline to facilitate the reach of the sustainability agreement and the detailing of the sustainability plan.

The afternoon session was open by representatives of Hanoi University (HANU) and Vietnamese National University of Agriculture (VNUA), that jointly presented the preliminary results of the first Aggregate Graduate Tracking data of Vietnamese universities (Universities partner of the MOTIVE project).

The presentation of first results was the baseline for the following discussion and a deeper analysis of data, results and knowledge transfer from European Partner to Vietnamese.

The session continues with the capacity building activities with the presentations made by European Partners (the presentation are available on the project website under the event description):

**INCOMA:** the representative Ms. Marina Camacho, presented the topic “Skills Graduates and Labour Market” including recommendations for Universities and career services, for Employers and last but not least for sector organizations and policy makers.

**University of Barcelona:** the representative of UB, prof. Aurelia Mane Estrada, Deputy Director of Doctoral School, shared and explained to the participants the experience of Catalan University System in collecting information through surveys of Graduates and the importance of such data collection.

**FH Joanneum University of Applied Sciences:** the representative of FH Joanneum. Mr. Dimitrios Doukas, open a very important discussion with a presentation related to the Business University cooperation, sharing the experience in Austria. This is a topic that emerge very often in the discussions among project consortium. All participants consider that in order to improve the graduates employability, the cooperation between business community and higher education sector is crucial.

Next day, the meeting open with the on line presentation of the winner of the “call for papers” for students. Ms. Nguyen Kim Ngan, student at Hanoi University and winner of the call for papers, presented the article “Career intention of university final-year students in Vietnam in the context of Covid-19”.

The audience interact with the speaker and continued with a session of Questions and answers related to the main results and conclusions presented.



The day continues with the presentation of the Portal of National Center for Graduates Tracking. The representative of Hanoi University IT department presented the draft of the structure of the portal and the debate starts with the participation also of the IT staff from AlmaLaurea, Mr. Luca Santandrea involved also in the development of the Voyage platform.

The Vietnamese partners presented the fact that the idea, after consultation not only among them, but also with other stakeholders, that the best way to create the Portal is that should be interlinked with the placement platform in order to avoid that the users (students, graduates, universities, companies) must register on to many platforms or websites in order to have access or be the beneficiary of such services.

The IT staff of the consortium propose different solutions to be interlinked and the development of the portal will continue. An updated version of the portal will be presented during the next meetings planned to take place during the project implementation period.

The last day of the meeting was dedicated to workshops. Different working groups were created (seeing that MOET representatives took part during the first two days, so we used their suggestions as baselines). The first one was a continuation of the Graduates Tracking data results. The topic was Graduates gender disparities in the labour market and AlmaLaurea presented the results of the Gender report that was developed in Italy and presented in 2022 and presented the results and outcomes of the gender report together with the graduates mobility in Italy.

The analysis of such report represents an important capacity building action to Vietnamese staff members of partner involved, by analysing graduates gender gap in the labour market.

This topic raised an interest especially from researchers from Hanoi University of Home Affairs and we discussed more in details the topic of gender inequalities graduates on labour market. The Representative of HUHA also suggested that could be interested to have some future analysis and development of this important topic. AlmaLaurea totally agreed with the Vietnamese suggestions and the Italian coordinator will be happy to develop future comparative analysis with Vietnamese partners.

The second workgroup discussed about the quality but also the quantity of data that can be collected in the framework of graduate tracking initiative can represent an important tool also for policy makers in order to reduce the gap that still exists among different categories of graduates and represent an important base for analysis for all stakeholders: higher education institutions, policy makers and enterprises.





Moreover, at the meeting was presented as well the initiative that AlmaLaurea is part of, Eurograduate 2022 survey.

This can represent an important topic that can be further developed so to allow to researchers in the future a comparability if such surveys carried out in Italy, Europe and Vietnam.

The meeting concluded with the presentation of the management and financial aspects. It was presented the situation for the second period of staff costs reporting.

As by the next meeting planned, due to the organizational reasons the partners proposed to change the location of the next meeting: from AJC Hanoi where supposed to take place to Halong University in Uong Bi City.

All partners agreed, but Halong University staff members will confirm whether is possible since they will be back in the University premises to check the availability of meeting rooms as well as the availability of other administrative staff that should be involved in the organization of the meeting. In the same time the University staff should talk with the Province authorities for the necessary authorization for the organization of the meeting with foreign guests.

#### **Dissemination channels of the event:**

##### **MOTIVE Project website:**

<https://motive-euproject.net/events/bologna-motive-meeting-capacity-transfer-and-1st-conference-graduates-and-labour-market-18-20-may-2022/>

##### **Motive Project Facebook page:**

[https://m.facebook.com/story.php?story\\_fbid=544051300576988&id=100779574904165](https://m.facebook.com/story.php?story_fbid=544051300576988&id=100779574904165)

##### **News on Vietnamese journals:**

[https://vietnamhoinhap.vn/vi/hoi-thao-sinh-vien-tot-nghiep-va-thi-truong-lao-dong-tai-cong-hoa-y-37742.htm?zarsrc=31&utm\\_source=zalo&utm\\_medium=zalo&utm\\_campaign=zalo](https://vietnamhoinhap.vn/vi/hoi-thao-sinh-vien-tot-nghiep-va-thi-truong-lao-dong-tai-cong-hoa-y-37742.htm?zarsrc=31&utm_source=zalo&utm_medium=zalo&utm_campaign=zalo)

<https://kinhtemoitruong.vn/hoi-thao-sinh-vien-tot-nghiep-va-thi-truong-lao-dong-tai-cong-hoa-y-67205.html>